

REMARKS

Summary

Claims 1-20 have been previously presented.

Claims 1-12, and 14-20 have been amended.

No Claims have been deleted.

No new claims have been added.

The claims have been amended to further clarify Applicants' presently claimed invention. Support for the amendments may be found in the specification, and in the claims as originally filed. No new matter has been added. The claims, as amended, are now in condition for allowance. Accordingly, the current amendments place the claims in a better form for consideration on appeal.

Claims 1-9 have been amended to further clarify that Applicants' recite a process for preparation of a color stable organic compound product from a finished organic compound, and that the process comprises combining the finished organic compound with water under conditions of agitation to produce the color stable organic compound product. Support for these amendments may be found on page 5, lines 23-30 of the application as filed. Claim 1 has also been amended to further clarify that the color stable organic compound product has an APHA color value of 15 or less after being boiled for at least one hour at one atmosphere of pressure. Support for this amendment may be found on page 2, lines 19-22 of the application as filed.

Claims 10-13 have been amended to further clarify that a crude product stream is introduced into the distillation column, and the inventive color stable organic compound is removed from the distillation column as a side stream. Support for these amendments may be found beginning on Page 4, line 3 to Page 5, line 2, and in particular, at Page 4 lines 3-5, and on Page 5, line 1. Claim 10 has also been amended to further clarify that the color stable organic compound product has an APHA color value of 15 or less after being boiled for at least one hour at one atmosphere of pressure. Support for this amendment may be found on page 2, lines 19-22 of the application as filed.

Claims 14-20, which recite a combination of the processes recited in Claims 1 and 10, have been amended to be consistent with the amendments made to Claims 1 and 10.

Claims 3 and 16 have been amended to further limit the conditions of agitation to include stirring. Support for these amendments may be found at Page 5, lines 25-26 of the application as filed.

Claim Rejections-35 U.S.C. 102(b) / 103(a)

Claims 1-20 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. §102(b), or in the alternative under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over U.S. Patent No. 3,214,347 to Grekel et al. (hereinafter Grekel.) The rejections are respectfully traversed.

As Examiner admits, Grekel teaches subjecting an aqueous mixture of crude acids to distillation and the stream being removed from the base of the column. This stream contains approximately 2 percent of the n-butyric acid present in the original feed. This distillate is then used as a feed under total reflux of water and the “product” is obtained in the overhead of the column. This “dry acid mixture” product is then further purified by distillation to a product which consists essentially of n-butyric acid (See Col. 7, line 69 to Col. 8, line 20.)

Applicants recite a process wherein a finished organic compound is combined with water under conditions of agitation. As admitted, Grekel is directed to purification of crude mixtures of acids, further processing of acid/water mixtures, and further distillations to produce the product or finished butyric acid. The finished butyric acid disclosed by Grekel is the starting point of Applicants' presently claimed invention. Grekel fails to teach or suggest combining of the finished product with water to produce a color stable organic compound.

In addition, Grekel admittedly utilizes column bottoms and overheads in the process. However, Applicants' have amended the presently claimed invention to further clarify that the products are taken from the column as a side stream, and that the finished products standard in the art are the starting materials of the presently claimed invention. Grekel is also silent as to the color stability of the product acid produced. However, Applicants' address this issue in Example I on Page 6 of the application as filed, noting that “commercially produced butyric acid” having an APHA color of 4, had an APHA color of 31 after being boiled for 1 hour at atmospheric pressure.

Grekel thus fails to disclose or suggest all of Applicants' recited steps. Grekel also fails to demonstrate cognition of Applicants' presently claimed invention. Accordingly,

Grekel cannot reasonably be found to anticipate, nor render obvious Applicants' presently claimed invention.

CONCLUSION

Applicant respectfully requests reconsideration of the present invention in view of the amendment and remarks noted above. Claims 1-20 are allowable and such notice of allowance is respectfully solicited.

Applicants invite the Examiner to contact the undersigned attorney by telephone if there are any matters or issues outstanding that have not been addressed to the Examiner's satisfaction.

Respectfully Submitted,

M. Susan Spiering

M. Susan Spiering
Attorney for Applicants

ATTORNEY US PTO Reg.No.: 34,933

Celanese Ltd.
IP Legal Dept., IZIP 701
P.O. Box 428
Bishop, TX 78343

Phone: 361.584.6084

Fax: 361.584.6230

Date: 6 April 2006